Large-scale glaciation and deglaciation of Antarctica during the Late Eocene

Shanan E. Peters¹, Anders E. Carlson¹, Daniel C. Kelly¹, and Philip D. Gingerich²
¹Department of Geoscience, University of Wisconsin, Madison, Wisconsin 53706, USA
²Department of Geological Sciences and Museum of Paleontology, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109, USA

ABSTRACT
Approximately 34 m.y. ago, Earth’s climate transitioned from a relatively warm, ice-free world to one characterized by cooler climates and a large, permanent Antarctic Ice Sheet. Understanding this major climate transition is important, but determining its causes has been complicated by uncertainties in the basic patterns of global temperature and ice volume change. Here we use an unusually well exposed coastal incised river-valley complex in the Western Desert of Egypt to show that eustatic sea level fell and then rose by ~40 m 2 m.y. prior to establishment of a permanent Antarctic Ice Sheet. This fall in sea level is associated with a positive oxygen isotope excursion that has been interpreted to reflect global cooling, but instead records buildup of an Antarctic Ice Sheet with a volume ~70% of the present-day East Antarctic Ice Sheet. Both the sea-level fall and subsequent rise were coincident with a transient oscillation in atmospheric CO₂ concentration down to ~750 ppm, which climate models indicate may be a threshold for Southern Hemisphere glaciation. Because many of the carbon emission scenarios for the coming century predict that atmospheric CO₂ will rise above this same 750 ppm threshold, our results suggest that global climate could transition to a state like the Late Eocene, when a large permanent Antarctic Ice Sheet was not sustainable.

INTRODUCTION
Earth’s climate has undergone numerous transitions between globally warm periods, with warm temperate conditions extending nearly to the poles, and globally cool periods, when large continental ice sheets formed and extended to middle latitudes (Zachos et al., 2008). The greatest global shift to cooler climate in the Cenozoic occurred near the Eocene-Oligocene boundary, ca. 33.8 Ma. Cooling and growth of continental ice during this time are evidenced by a large positive excursion in the mean δ¹⁸O composition of benthic and planktonic foraminifer (Kennett, 1977; Miller et al., 1987; Zachos et al., 2001; Katz et al., 2008), deepening of the ocean’s calcite compensation depth (Rea and Lyle, 2005; Coxall et al., 2005), a decline in high-latitude sea surface temperatures (Liu et al., 2009), and widespread deposition of ice-rafted debris and glacial till at high southern latitudes (Wilson et al., 1998). Proposed mechanisms for this fundamental change in the global climate system include a decrease in atmospheric CO₂ (DeConto and Pollard, 2003; Huber and Nof, 2006; Pearson et al., 2009), a minimum in solar insolation (Coxall et al., 2005), and changes in ocean circulation caused by the opening of the Southern Ocean and isolation of the Antarctic continent (Kennett, 1977).

Despite ample evidence for global cooling and expansion of the Antarctic Ice Sheet near the Eocene-Oligocene boundary (Barker et al., 2007; Lear et al., 2008), the magnitudes of global temperature and ice volume changes during the Late Eocene remain poorly constrained. This is primarily because one of the most widely used indicators of paleoclimate, the δ¹³C composition of marine carbonates, cannot distinguish between changes in temperature and changes in continental ice volume. Uncertainty about the relative contributions of these two factors is particularly acute for initial phases of the Eocene-Oligocene climate transition, when temperature and ice volume fluctuations may have been transient, decoupled, and below the detection limits of temperature proxy records (Zachos et al., 2001, 2008; Liu et al., 2009).

Here we provide new constraints on the magnitude of Late Eocene glacioeustatic sea-level fluctuations by studying an unusually well exposed coastal incised valley fill complex at Wadi Al-Hitan in the Western Desert of Egypt (Fig. 1). Incised valley fills are formed by fluvial erosion and downcutting during a fall in sediment base level, which in coastal regions is controlled principally by lowering of sea level (Zaitlin et al., 1994). Subsequent rise in sea level traps fluvial and estuarine sediment in the newly cut river valley, thereby forming an incised valley fill. Evidence for Late Eocene sea-level change has been found globally (e.g., Hardenbol et al., 1998; Barker et al., 2007; Katz et al., 2008; Miller et al., 2008). However, the sections at Wadi Al-Hitan provide a unique opportunity to rigorously quantify the magnitude of sea-level fluctuation during this critical period of Earth history, because they are among the best exposed Late Eocene marine coastal sections in the world.

METHODS
At Wadi Al-Hitan, it is possible to trace a coastal incised valley fill complex and its adjacent interfluve over a distance of >16 km nearly parallel to an ancient shoreface (Fig. 1). Sediments within the incised valley fill preserve unambiguous indicators of deposition in fluvial and estuarine environments, including asymmetric current ripples with unimodal transport vectors, lags of imbricated pebbles containing whale fossils that were reworked from underlying marine sediments and mixed with remains of terrestrial mammals, and tidal rhythmites that contain dicot plant leaves but no marine
fossils (Peters et al., 2009). The intensively bioturbated, fossil-bearing marine sandstones into which the incised valley fill is cut were deposited in environments that range from transition zone to shoreface (Peters et al., 2009; see the GSA Data Repository).

Upstream parameters, such as drainage area, precipitation patterns, and bedrock characteristics, influence large-scale incised valley fill geometry, particularly cross-sectional area (Mattheus et al., 2007); however, the maximum incision depth of coastal incised valley fill complexes is controlled primarily by the magnitude and rate of sediment base-level fall (Zaitlin et al., 1994). In coastal environments, base level, or the point at which down-elevation sediment transport potential approaches zero, is controlled principally by sea level, with smaller contributions from the depth and intensity of wave agitation. In order for an incised valley fill to be preserved in the rock record, subsequent rise in base level must trap fluvial and estuarine sediment within the river valley, thereby filling the valley and restoring a planar geomorphic surface. Coastal incised valley fills, therefore, provide important constraints on the magnitude of sea-level fall as well as evidence for subsequent sea-level rise.

Our mapping of the 7 km incised valley fill extent shows that the valley floor varies considerably in depth, but it has a maximum incision of 46 m (Fig. 2). To convert the observed maximum incised valley fill incision depth to a minimum estimate of eustatic sea-level fall, it is first necessary to adjust for isostatic rebound of the crust that may occur when the gravitational load imposed by seawater is removed. Assuming an instantaneous isostatic regional adjustment for ~10–20 m of seawater removal prior to fluvial incision, a conservative estimate for the global minimum sea-level fall required to form a 46-m-deep coastal incised valley fill complex is 42 ± 1 m (see the Data Repository). Although it is necessary to account for the gravitational effects of ice-mass distribution on sea surface elevation, this geoid effect is expected to account for only 1–2 m of sea-level change in the southeastern Mediterranean region (Mitrovica et al., 2009; see the Data Repository). Thus, the estimated minimum eustatic sea-level fall required to form the incised valley fill is 40 ± 2 m.

The entire incised valley fill succession is capped by fossiliferous marine sediments that record a subsequent rise in sea level that was of sufficient magnitude and rapidity to overcome fluvial sediment supply and fill the incised valley fill with estuarine sediment, to displace the shoreface landward, and to restore shallow-marine (~10 m) conditions to the region. Thus, the rise in sea level recorded by the incised valley fill succession is comparable in magnitude to that of the preceding fall (~40 m). An additional ~90 m of Late Eocene marine sediment was deposited above the incised valley fill prior to the Eocene-Oligocene boundary (see the Data Repository).

Because the incised valley fill at Wadi Al-Hitan is exceptionally well exposed, it is possible to trace stratigraphic surfaces continuously within and adjacent to the incised valley fill. Doing so revealed the erosional remnants of shorter duration sequences that formed during multiple cycles of subaerial exposure and fluvial incision followed by marine inundation and incised valley fill formation. The rapidity and cyclical nature of the ~10–15 m sea-level changes that are evidenced by these smaller scale sequences are inconsistent with control of local sea level by faulting or other vertical crustal motion (Watts, 1982). Instead, the stratigraphic data indicate rapid eustatic sea-level changes superimposed on a longer term and larger magnitude eustatic sea-level fall and rise.

Additional support for the hypothesis that eustatic sea-level changes were responsible for the formation of the incised valley fill complex at Wadi Al-Hitan derives from sequence stratigraphic analyses conducted in other regions. The marine sediments that enclose the incised valley fill yield age-diagnostic calcareous nanoplankton, and some of the recovered taxa have overlapping global first and last appearance datums that constrain the age of the incised valley fill (see the Data Repository). In particular, the presence of Isthmolithus recurvus Deflandre and Neococcolithes minutus (Perch-Nielsen) constrains the timing of incised valley fill formation to near the base of nanofossil Zone NP19-20 (Perch-Nielsen, 1989), ca. 36 Ma (Berggren et al., 1995; Gradstein et al., 2004). Thus, the sequence boundary that floors the incised valley fill is equivalent to the Pr-2 sequence boundary at the base of NP19-20 in Europe (Hardenbol et al., 1998) and the American Gulf Coast (Miller et al., 2008). Evidence for a significant sea-level fall and rise near the transition between Zones NP18 and NP19-20 is, therefore, not limited to

---

Figure 2. Field image and schematic cross section of incised valley fill (IVF) and enclosing marine sediments. A: Panoramic overview of IVF margin. Dashed lines show lateral position of photo in B. B: Schematic cross section based on digital field mapping (see footnote 1). Subhorizontal thin black lines show traceable marine stratigraphic surfaces. Heavier black lines are sequence boundaries (SB). Heaviest line marks main SB at base of IVF complex. Subsidiary SBs are shown by thinner bold lines. Dashed lines represent unmapped SBs within IVF complex. Note truncation of subhorizontal marine strata by IVF. Minimum sea-level fall is estimated from vertical distance that separates interfluve SB (ISB) from SB at deepest point of IVF (maximum incision). Vertical exaggeration ~22x. TST—transgressive systems tract; FSST—falling stage systems tract; HST—highstand systems tract.
Egypt. However, because the section at Egypt is exceptionally well exposed and preserves unambiguous and laterally traceable incised valley fill deposits, it is possible to measure the magnitude of sea-level fluctuations in ways that are not possible elsewhere.

DISCUSSION

Biostratigraphic data indicate that the timing of valley incision closely coincides with a +0.30‰ shift in mean benthic δ18O (Figs. 3A and 3D; see the Data Repository). This positive excursion has previously been assumed to record 1–2 °C of cooling precursory to glacialization in Antarctica (Vonhof et al., 2000). Given, however, that the formation of the Egyptian incised valley fill complex requires substantial eustatic sea-level fall and rise within a geologically short time interval, the positive δ18O excursion is more likely to be the isotopic expression of continental ice-sheet growth. Because CO2 levels in the Late Eocene were above the threshold for Northern Hemisphere glaciation (Pagani et al., 2005; DeConto et al., 2008), the most probable locus of such growth is Antarctica.

With a new independent estimate for the magnitude of glacioeustatic sea-level change, it is possible to predict the δ18O excursion that would be expected due only to ice volume effects. Climate model simulations from the Eocene-Oligocene transition indicate a mean Antarctic ice δ18O composition of ~30‰ ± 5‰ (DeConto et al., 2008). The growth of a 40 ± 2 m sea-level-equivalent volume of ice would increase the mean δ18O of ocean water by 0.34‰ ± 0.07‰ (see the Data Repository). Thus, it is likely that most or all of the observed +0.30‰ δ18O shift ca. 36.0 Ma was caused by an increase in continental ice volume rather than 1–2 °C cooling of the deep ocean (Vonhof et al., 2000). High-latitude sea surface temperature records also suggest reduced amounts of cooling relative to previous estimates, although uncertainties and low sample resolution preclude precise temperature estimates for this event (Liu et al., 2009).

The positive δ18O excursion ca. 36.0 Ma is followed by a negative excursion of similar magnitude ca. 35.8 Ma (Fig. 3D). This decrease in δ18O reflects the retreat of ice on Antarctica and is recorded stratigraphically at Wadi Al-Hitan by the in-filling of the incised valley fill with fluvoestuarine sediment and by the restoration of shallow, normal marine shelf conditions to the region (Fig. 2). Numerous cycles of ~10 m sea-level rise and fall within the incised valley fill and in the immediately overlying marine strata indicate increased volatility in sea level during periods of large-scale Antarctic glaciation (see the Data Repository), possibly in response to orbital forcing of ice growth and decay. Changes of ~10 m in sea-level-equivalent volumes of ice would affect benthic δ18O by only ~0.08‰, which is below the detection level of global mean benthic δ18O records (Fig. 3D).

A: Global benthic δ18O stack with 5-point smoothing (Zachos et al., 2001, 2008). The +0.30‰ excursion ca. 36 Ma (gray bar) is observed in individual benthic records (Vonhof et al., 2000; Zachos et al., 1999; Ehrmann and Mackensen, 1992). B: Foraminifera 87Sr/86Sr from Ocean Drilling Program (ODP) Site 689B (Mead and Holdell, 1995); red symbols—individual measurements, black line—5-point smoothing. Lower-resolution 87Sr/86Sr records from ODP Sites 744 and 748 are similar (Zachos et al., 1999). C: Atmospheric CO2; black bars are from Pagani et al. (2005); purple bars are from Pearson et al. (2009). Horizontal blue line indicates Antarctic glaciation CO2 threshold of 750 ppm (DeConto and Pollard, 2003; DeConto et al., 2008). Gray bars denote ~0.3‰ δ18O increase and larger δ18O increase at E-O boundary. Calcareous nanoplankton zones (NP17–NP23) are shown on x axis (Gradstein et al., 2004). D: Benthic δ18O stack. Vertical range shows 40 m eustatic sea-level (SL) component of the δ18O increase as determined from incised valley fill (IVF). E: 21 December insolation at 65 °S (Laskar et al., 2004). F: Foraminifera 87Sr/86Sr (Mead and Holdell, 1995). Gray bar shows interval of ~0.3‰ 87Sr/86Sr increase.

Figure 3. Oxygen and strontium isotopes, CO2, and insolation during Eocene-Oligocene (E-O) climate transition. A: Global benthic δ18O stack. B: Foraminifera 87Sr/86Sr from ODP Site 689B (Mead and Holdell, 1995); red symbols—individual measurements, black line—5-point smoothing. Lower-resolution 87Sr/86Sr records from ODP Sites 744 and 748 are similar (Zachos et al., 1999). C: Atmospheric CO2; black bars are from Pagani et al. (2005); purple bars are from Pearson et al. (2009). Horizontal blue line indicates Antarctic glaciation CO2 threshold of 750 ppm (DeConto and Pollard, 2003; DeConto et al., 2008). Gray bars denote ~0.3‰ δ18O increase and larger δ18O increase at E-O boundary. Calcareous nanoplankton zones (NP17–NP23) are shown on x axis (Gradstein et al., 2004). D: Benthic δ18O stack. Vertical range shows 40 m eustatic sea-level (SL) component of the δ18O increase as determined from incised valley fill (IVF). E: 21 December insolation at 65 °S (Laskar et al., 2004). F: Foraminifera 87Sr/86Sr (Mead and Holdell, 1995). Gray bar shows interval of ~0.3‰ 87Sr/86Sr increase.

Two factors may have contributed to the growth and decay of a large Antarctic Ice Sheet. First, atmospheric CO2 declined by >1000 ppm through the Eocene and Oligocene (Zachos et al., 2008), but also underwent several oscillations, beginning with a drop to 660–930 ppm ca. 36 Ma (Pagani et al., 2005) (Fig. 3C). Glacial climate model simulations suggest a threshold response of Antarctic glaciation to a drop in CO2 below ~750 ppm, with ice-sheet growth causing a sea-level fall of 40–50 m and an increase in ocean δ18O of ~0.3‰ (DeConto and Pollard, 2003; DeConto et al., 2008). These predictions are consistent with the sea-level history recorded by the incised valley fill complex at Wadi Al-Hitan and with benthic δ18O records (Fig. 3D).

The second factor that may have contributed to the onset of glaciation in Antarctica is a change in Earth’s orbital parameters, wherein a reduction in the peak amplitude of astral summer insolation at the onset of the CO2 decline (Fig. 3E) enhanced the accumulation of snow and ice via diminished summer ablation. Orbital cycles may have been important in promoting the glaciation of Antarctica prior to the major global cooling ca. 33.8 Ma (Liu et al., 2009), but orbital parameters alone cannot explain the onset or termination of glaciation because they are nonunique (Laskar et al., 2004). This leaves change in atmospheric CO2 as the most probable driver of the transient glaciation and deglaciation of Antarctica during the Late Eocene.

The physical and geochemical evidence presented here indicates that the Antarctic Ice Sheet achieved at least 70% of the volume of the present-day East Antarctic Ice Sheet ca. 36.0 Ma before partially or wholly melting. Growth and decay of the ice sheet appear to have been paced by changes in atmospheric CO2 concentration.
that oscillated around ~750 ppm. Furthermore, sea level fluctuated tens of meters during this interval, suggesting a highly volatile East Antarctic Ice Sheet when CO$_2$ concentrations were near this threshold value. Because many of the carbon emission scenarios for the coming century predict that atmospheric CO$_2$ will cross this same 750 ppm threshold (Solomon et al., 2007), our results raise the possibility that global climate could rapidly transition to a state not unlike the Late Eocene, when a large, permanent East Antarctic Ice Sheet was not sustainable.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank A. Carroll, P. Cohen, B. Wilkinson, and P.L. McLatchi for discussion and M.S. Antar, E. Williams, and I. Zalmout for help in the field. M.M. Fouda, Director of the Nature Conservation Sector of the Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency, encouraged work at Wadi Al-Hitan. We also thank B. Wade and two anonymous reviewers for helpful comments. Research supported by the Egyptian Mineral Resources Authority, CA, Geological Museum, Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency, and U.S. National Science Foundation (grants 0517773 and 0920972).

REFERENCES CITED


Manuscript received 28 January 2010
Revised manuscript received 10 March 2010
Manuscript accepted 11 March 2010
Printed in USA